

# Emerging neurotechnologies: Trends, relevance and prospects

Vidya N. Nukala\*1 and William E. Halal<sup>2</sup>

1. Wellcome Trust/DBT India Alliance, 8-2-684/3/K/19, Road No. 12, Banjara Hills, Hyderabad-500034, INDIA. \*Email: Vid. Nukala@gmail.com. 2. Department of Information Systems & Technology Management, George Washington University, Washington, DC, 20052.

## Abstract

Neurotechnologies are at the forefront of converging technologies because of their potential to restore and enhance normal brain function. Some dual-use neurotechnologies are used to assess the structure and function of the brain, others are interventional. These applications can diagnose and treat neurological conditions, and/or alter emotions, decision-making and productivity. Additionally, neurotechnologies may determine and define what it means to be human as we know it. Currently, an inventory of neurotechnological advancements is lacking, despite discussions of the current and future developments and the ensuing ethical issues. This paper aims to elucidate the range and pace of neurotechnologic innovation and their applications for future policy. Using the 'scanning' technique to assess the latest developments published on the internet, online databases were searched utilizing English key words for verified, authentic sources of data in the field of neurotechnological developments found were broadly categorized into - 1) Monitoring and Imaging; 2) Modeling and Reverse Engineering; 3) Brain-Machine Interfaces and Prosthetics/Orthotics; 4) Neuromics; and 5) Psychopharmacology. The impact of neurotechnologies is being increasingly felt - beyond medicine - in business, law, sports, arts and entertainment, national defense and even religion, and is laden with both promise and (potential) peril. This paper 1) attempts to establishe a 'baseline' against which to compare future advances in the field by providing depiction of current state-of-the-art neurotechnologies, and 2) raises ethical and policy questions that warrant further investigation.

Key words: neurotechnologies, neuroethics, scanning techniques, forecasting, technology convergence, policy implications

"...The union of human and machine, in which the knowledge and skills embedded in our brains will be combined with the vastly greater capacity, speed, and knowledge-sharing ability of our own creations. That merging is the essence of the Singularity, an era in which our intelligence will become increasingly nonbiological and trillions of times more powerful than it is today—the dawning of a new civilization that will enable us to transcend our biological limitations and amplify our creativity.

In this new world, there will be no clear distinction between human and machine, real reality and virtual reality. We will be able to assume different bodies and take on a range of personae at will. In practical terms, human aging and illness will be reversed; pollution will be stopped; world hunger and poverty will be solved. Nanotechnology will make it possible to create virtually any physical product using inexpensive information processes and will ultimately turn even death into a soluble problem."

# Visions for the Future

The 'Singularity', anticipated to occur around 2045 (1), is but one of the many visions offered for our future. The current "Knowledge Era" driven by information technologies is proposed to give rise to the "Age of Consciousness" during 2020-30 (2), and creation of a "Health Advocate Avatar" by 2029 (3). Others have offered future visions to include a plateau, recurrent collapse and extinction of human civilizations as alternatives to post-humanity (4). These visions are typically accompanied by varying levels of acceptance about the pursuit and directionality of technology. Indeed, there is a perceptible divide- among scientists, technologists, ethicists, religious followers and lay public- about the reliance upon technology as a means to improve the human condition. Broadly, these perceptions and positions can be grouped into 'transhumanists' and 'bioconservatives' constituting the two poles of the new 'biopolitical' axis (5). This provides a novel paradigm of economic and cultural socio-politics. These divides manifest in the form of debates and movements, for

– Ray Kurzweil (1)

example, about human identity and dignity, reproductive rights, life extension and human enhancement.

# **Converging Technologies**

Technology has existed since before civilization in various forms (6). A major shift occurred when technology moved from a gross production mode to one based on or rooted in knowledge (6,7).

*Technological Convergence* is the term assigned to the inevitable, progressive and ever accelerating merging of information, biomedical and nanotechnologies (8-10). While each field or sector is undergoing progress in itself, the trend points to increasingly cross-sectoral developments that will elicit a greater impact (8). These interactions have grown to the point of being "the rule" rather than the exception. Information technology has been leading the technologic revolution thus far, but nanotechnology is considered to be the next wave that will irrevocably alter the overall millieu (9).

Information Technology (IT): Within the information technology sector, enhanced data processing and storage, increased voice and language processing, widespread wireless technology, integrated entertainment and communication systems, and e-work are envisioned over the next decade (3,8). Information technology was extensively utilized in the Human Genome Project (HGP), launched in 1990, that sequenced and mapped the large number of genes of Homo sapiens. Such a synergistic crossover of technologies is anticipated to continue.

*Biomedical Technology (BT)*: Aided by information and nanotechnologies, further advances are expected in the realm of biotechnology (3,8). These include: computational chemistry for drug design; bioinformatics to process large amounts of biomedical data; instant and reliable screening and diagnostic tests; pharmacogenomics for personalized medicine; stem cell and genetic therapy; tissue engineering, and artificial limbs/organs. Taking genetic engineering one step further, there is momentum to create biological systems that do not occur naturally, as well as to re-engineer existing biological systems to perform novel tasks, contributing to the emerging field of *synthetic biology*.

*Nanotechnology (NT)*: Current research aimed at nanomaterials can have the potential to create 3-dimensional structural self-assemblies that can be used as components in devices and systems of information technology. This changes dependence from microelectronics to nanoelectronics, and thus allows for molecular computing. Potential applications of these technologies include environmental surveillance monitors, enhanced batteries and biological sensors, targeted drug delivery and improved performance of medical implants and prosthetic devices (3,8).

*Cognitive Sciences*: A confluence of IT, nanotechnology and biology is occuring in cognitive science- a field comprising cognitive psychology, cultural anthropology, neuroscience and artificial intelligence (9). Cognitive science refers to psychological and physiological processes that underlie neural information processing, emotion, motivation, social influence and development. Aided by the aforementioned technologies, cognitive science and neurotechnologies are an important focus of the proposed, forthcoming Decade of the Mind.

#### Neurotechnologies and Neuroethics

Neurotechnologies (also called cognitive technologies) can be defined as a set of tools, methodologies and approaches to monitor, access, restore/treat, or augment/ enhance and/or stimulate the nervous system. Neurotechnologies are an integral part of the progressive and accelerated convergence of knowledge and capabilities of bio-, nano- and information technologies are well as existing technologies that are used in novel applications.

Neuroethics refers to both the neurological mechanisms of morality, and the ethical (legal, economic, and social) issues arising out of research and applications of the neurosciences and neurotechnologies (11). In this latter domain, the issues include safety, privacy, stigma, discrimination, and justice. In addition, since neurotechnologies alter brain function - and thus affect consciousness and mind - neuroethics also addresses novel and growing concerns of responsibility, moral regard, and human identity.

#### **Objectives**

According to the latest Neurotechnology Industry Report (12), in 2008 –

• Brain-related illnesses are the largest unmet medical market, affecting over two billion people worldwide

- Global neurotechnology industry revenues rose 9.0% to \$144.5 billion
- Neuropharmaceutical sales recorded revenues of \$121.6 billion and 9.3% annual growth
- Neurodevice sales recorded revenues of \$6.1 billion and 18.6% annual growth
- Neurodiagnostic sales recorded revenues of \$16.8 billion and 4% annual growth.

As staggering as these numbers may seem, the data do not capture the current breadth and depth of neurotechnological innovation. To appreciate the impact of converging technologies over the next few decades- and the ensuing ethical and policy issues, such convergence may generate- it becomes necessary to assess the state-of-the-art of neurotechnology. Several studies have discussed current and future developments relevant to a particular topic/ area of interest, or group of technologies (13-23). However, an more complete inventory of neuroscientific findings and technological advancements is currently lacking, and definitions and categories are not entirely consistent among these studies.

Thus, the objective of the present study was to elucidate the range and pace of salient innovations in neurotechnology. We employed the well-established *scanning* method to conduct online searches for the latest developments published on the internet. We then categorized the data appropriately, and provided representative examples for each of the categories. We intend that this baseline will give scholars and policy-makers a sense of the directionality of neurotechnological advancement. Finally, we conclude the discussion with an outline of ethics and policy issues that beg further study.

# Method

Emerging technologies are prone to both optimistic and pessimistic forecasts. Therefore, any forecasting needs to be based upon rational, explicit and rigorous scrutiny, preparation and analyses. This could involve various techniques, such as environment scanning, past and current trend analysis, polling, modeling and scenario building among others, to identify those fields that reveal indicators of progress, promise and problems (24).

Most predictions/projections of emerging technologies typically include -a) *year* of emergence of a particular technology, b) *probability* of such an estimate, c) the *market demand*, and d) the *country* where it originates

(23,25). Unlike hypothesis testing, forecasting does not claim to eliminate uncertainty. However, it does provide for an estimated temporal window for a given technology to develop, and this is often adequate for policy makers to anticipate and respond, and affect the societal impact(s) of any new technology.

A first step is to realistically asses the current state-of-the field. *Environmental scanning* is a well-established technique that allows depiction of significant breakthroughs, as well as revealing areas with most and least activity within the field (23). In addition, scanning also facilitates identifying developments in seemingly unrelated fields that may have significantly impact upon the target technology of interest.

The paper utilizes this scanning technique, exploiting the databases of latest developments as published on the internet. Key words were entered into the Google web search engine as well as PubMed online database, and included generic terms (ex: neurotechnologies, reverse engineering and brain-machine interfaces) as well as more focused searches (ex: virtual reality, fMRI and exoskeletons). This yielded results from a range of sources including original scientific literature, media and company publications, reports and other articles. Data were traced to their original sources and verified for authenticity before being included in the results. Each selected data point was linked to its online source and date of publication, and was subsequently grouped into one of the five categories discussed in the proceeding section. Representative publications through this method are presented in Tables I-V. Of course, these citations do not represent or reflect all of the scientific and/or lay literature that is available to address each of the topical domains. Torward that end, a multiple resource (e.g.- Index Medicus; Scopus; EMBASE; etc.) polyglot (i.e., multi-lingual) search is recommended.

# Results

Neurotechnologies have the capacity to fulfill both medical *needs*, and also the potential to realize non-medical *desires*. It is important to remember that needs and desires can vary significantly among individuals, within the same individual over time, and between particular groups and societies.

Neurotechnologies can be classified, for the purposes of clarity, into five major categories based upon the mode of action and/or function; these are: 1) Monitoring and Imaging,

- 2) Modeling and Reverse Engineering,
- 3) Brain-Machine Interfaces and Prosthetics/Orthotics,
- 4) Neuromics, and
- 5) Psychopharmacology.

For each category of neurotechnology, we provide a brief description, followed by scanning data of its current and potential future uses, to illustrate the range and pace of innovation(s). Each headline is followed by the source and date of publication (for supplemental source information, please refer to the Notes section of this manuscript). However, the discussion will refrain from 1) making forecasts, or projections; 2) analyzing the validity of the scientific theory, method and mechanism; 3) predicting likelihood of success; 4) analyzing timeframe and magnitude of impact; and 5) posing specific ethical arguments for or against any technology. In this way, this paper will serve more as a descriptive, informative survey of the numerous (and at times perhaps unsettling) possibilities enabled/afforded by current neurotechnology.

1) *Monitoring and Imaging* tools are non-invasive approaches that are primarily used in diagnostic or research settings to study brain anatomy, detect static or real time brain activity, and differentially localize activities to particular neuroanatomical regions (13-15). Examples of such technologies include positron emission tomography (PET), single photon emission computerized tomography (SPECT), functional magnetic resonance imaging (fMRI), and diffusion tensor imaging (DTI). Physiological monitoring technologies include magneto-and quantitative encephalography (MEG, QEEG). The EEG technologies measure electrical or magnetic fluctuations

#### Table I: Neurotechnologies- Monitoring and Imaging

- An fMRI study explains how the same neural code in the brain allows people to distinguish between different types of sounds, such as speech and music, or different images. [PhysOrg, 08/12/09]<sup>i</sup>
- fMRI studies indicate love activates the same system as the one with cocaine. [Esquire, 05/18/09] <sup>ii</sup>
- Using fMRI, psychologists have found that thought pattern used to recall the past and imagine the future is strikingly similar. [Science Daily, 07/01/07]<sup>iii</sup>
- Researchers find that fMRI may measure not only what the brain is doing, but what it is about to do. [Scientific American, 01/22/09] <sup>iv</sup>
- A PET scan, followed by fMRI, of asymptomatic patients has shown promise to predict onset of Alzheimer's disease (AD). [Neuron, 07/29/09] v
- Companies like No Lie MRI and Cephos *claim* to provide unbiased brain imaging methods for 'truth verification' with 90-93% accuracy. [Time, 07/20/09] <sup>vi</sup>
- fMRI study of men and women under stress showed how their brains differed in response to stressful situations. [Science Daily, 04/01/08] vii
- An EEG test is able to predict whether people in their 60's and 70's will develop dementia over the next 7 to 10 years with up to 95% accuracy. [Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences, 04/02/07] viii
- Amen Clinics is using single photon emission computed tomography (SPECT) brain imaging in making neuropsychiatric diagnoses and individualizing treatment plans (ex: ADHD in children).<sup>ix</sup>
- A neuroeconomic fMRI study provides a formal account of how we weigh our different experiences in guiding our future actions. [Nature Neuroscience, 08/05/07] \*
- Neuromarketing study of media by Sands Research challenges instant analysis of 2009 Super Bowl XLIII ads. [Reuters, 02/24/09] <sup>xi</sup>
- fMRI study on meditation revealed significantly larger cerebral volumes and increased gray matter in meditators. [Science Daily, 05/13/09] xii
- fMRI scans provide further evidence that religion involves neurological regions vital for social intelligence. [Wired, 10/02/09] xiii

of neuronal activities; (these approaches record changes in localization of radioactive isotope-based binding or cerebral blood flow respectively, and both provide indirect measures of neural activity).

Despite extant limitations of this technology (14), the spatial and temporal resolution of monitoring and imaging technologies is expected to significantly improve over the coming years, accompanied by an exponential increase in computing power, and reductions in scanner size and costs. This affords the potential to conduct realtime scans- even molecular imaging- of moving patients. Such uses may be enable assessment and enhancement of cognitive ability, diagnosis of neurodegenerative diseases, prediction of aggression or early violence, detect deception and evaluate consumer marketing preferences. This in turn may lead to the expansion of the relatively new fields of neuroeconomics/neuromarketing, and neurosecurity. (See Table I.)

2) *Modeling and Reverse Engineering* is a major thrust of computational biology and bioinformatics [14,16]. Computing analyses of large volumnes of data from DNA, RNA and protein sequencing of the brain will become increasingly important to understand the molecular neuro-biology, as a component of neuroinformatics. The hardware typically consists of numerous, parallel high-end computers, while sophisticated software algorithms aim to incorporate the complexity of the neural

#### Table II: Neurotechnologies – Modeling and Reverse Engineering

- The NIH Blueprint for Neuroscience Research launched a \$30 million Human Connectome Project (HCP) that will use cutting-edge brain imaging technologies to map the circuitry of the healthy adult human brain. [NIH, 07/15/09]<sup>i</sup>
- The Allen Human Brain Atlas is a genome-wide map of gene expression in the human brain that combines information about gene activity with anatomic knowledge. [Allen Institute for Brain Science, 2003] <sup>ii</sup>
- Hanson Robotics has developed the robotic Einstein to explore how a machine can perceive and react to human facial expressions, eye contact, face recognition and spoken conversation. [Smithsonian Magazine, 07/09]<sup>iii</sup>
- Neuromantic is a free application for the semi-automatic reconstruction of 3D models of neurons. [University of Reading, 03/31/08] <sup>iv</sup>
- The Fast Analog Computing with Emergent Transient States (FACETS) Project developed a chip that simulates the learning capabilities of the human brain. [MIT Technology Review, 03/25/09] v
- DARPA awarded US\$4.9 million to IBM and its collaborators to develop 'Cognitive Computing' where electronic circuits mimic brains. [BBC Science & Environment, 11/21/08] <sup>vi</sup>
- Numenta is creating a new type of computing technology Hierarchical Temporal Memory (HTM) modeled on the structure and operation of the neocortex. [Guardian, 04/10/08] <sup>vii</sup>
- The Cybernetic Intelligence Group at University of Reading has developed a robot named Gordon controlled by a 'brain' formed from cultured rat neurons. [ZDNet, 08/13/08] viii
- Stanford University's Neurogrid carries out simulations large enough to include interactions between cortical areas, yet detailed enough to account for distinct cellular properties. [MIT Technology Review, 03/25/09] <sup>ix</sup>
- DARPA is investing US\$ 3 million for the Systems of Neuromorphic Adaptive Plastic Scalable Electronics (SyNAPSE) program to develop a brain inspired electronic 'chip' that mimics the function, size, and power consumption of a biological cortex. [Wired, 02/07/08] \*
- The €6.7 million European Union backed SENSOrimotor structuring of Perception and Action for emergent Cognition (SENSOPAC) project has built part of an artificial mouse brain. [Wall Street Journal, 07/14/09] <sup>xi</sup>
- The Harvard-MIT Complex Biosystems Modeling Laboratory has developed a multiscale agent-based 3D model for simulating brain cancer heterogeneity. [Mathematical and Computer Modelling, 05/24/08] <sup>xii</sup>
- The Blue Brain Project claims that a detailed, functional artificial human brain can be built within the next 10 years. [BBC Technology, 07/22/09] xiii
- CoTeSys and Fly-O-Vision have built flight simulators to study blowflies to build flying robots. [Wired, 07/31/09] xiv
- Project One is a US\$ 3million National Science Foundation funded project that developed a humanoid robot CB2 which exhibits levels of complexity found in human infants. [Google News, 04/04/09] <sup>xv</sup>
- Decisions in Motion has developed a robot capable of moving autonomously using humanlike visual processing and object detection. [MIT Technology Review, 06/30/09] <sup>xvi</sup>

networks and their properties. Mathematical modeling of several variables, incorporating the analyzed data, is conducted for hypothesis-testing, and making predictions of system behavior, *in silico*.

Such computer simulations allow for experiments that can not be feasibly or ethically conducted in animals and humans. Robots are being constructed that not only mimic human activity in everyday settings, but allow use in dangerous environments. The development and construction of an artificially intelligent system that can learn, behave, perform, and maintain some level of autopoiesis, is the ultimate quest of paradigms that seek to reverse engineer the nervous system. (See Table II.)

3) Brain-Machine Interfaces (BMI) and Prosthetics/ Orthotics are systems that operationalize the intersection of the nervous system and an internal or external device to effectively combine human and machine capabilities (14, 17). Characteristically, they are instruments (such as bionic limbs, cochlear and retinal implants, wheelchairs and synthetic speech software) aimed at restoring (i.e.prosthetics) or enhancing (i.e.- orthotics) motor, sensory, communicative, or cognitive function.

BMI tools, such as transcranial and deep brain stimulation, are most often used in neurorehabilitation following stroke, paralysis, and/or traumatic brain and spinal cord injuries, although such technology could potentially be extended to affect- if not enhance- learning and memory. Alternately, *virtual reality (VR)*, a computer-based multi-sensory technology, can be used to manipulate the senses to give an alternate sense of reality, for example, in schizophrenia to help the patients distinguish between virtual and real worlds or training soldiers for combat.

Much innovative and commercial diversity is occurring within the field of BMI and neuroprosthetics. The fusion of human and non-biological elements is expected to continue into the future, so as to enact the iterative process of 'cyborgization' described- and predicted- by Clynes and Kline (26). This process, to a large extent, remains subtle.

Simpler devices or methods used in everyday life are more innocuous. Technologies such as memory storing devices (for music, documents and other information) and communication methods (cell phones, emails, GPS and the internet) all supplement human brain function. Yet, despite the relatively 'simplicity' of these tools, it is important to notice the technological convergence that occurs when different functionalities are combined into singular devices or methods. (See Table III.)

4) *Neuromics* broadly refers to the study and application(s) of genomics, proteomics and metabolomics in contexts of the nervous system structure and function (18, 19). Neurogenetics entails the elucidation of genetic mechanisms involved in normal neurocognitive function, and neurological (e.g.- Alzheimer's and Huntington's) and psychiatric (e.g.- depression) conditions. *Neuroproteomics* seeks to study those proteins involved in brain function, while *neurometabolomics* aims to identify metabolic processes engaged in and/or subvserving neurophysiologic and neuropathologic events.

Approxiately 10,000 genes (a third of the human genome), and three times as many proteins are putatively involved in brain function. Very few, if any, normal or abnormal brain functions reflect activity of a single gene or protein. Thus, the goals of these fields of genomics, proteomics, and metabolomics- to attempt modulation of existing genes, and/or insertion of, new genes, proteins and metabolites, by targeting specific regions of the brain to elicit a specific response, to treat or enhance brain function- remains daunting. Still, there have been some successes in narrowing the selection of possible candidate genes and proteins that affect predisposition(s) for specific conditions (e.g.- apolipoprotein E (ApoE) in Alzheimer's; serotonin reuptake transporter (5-HTT) in depression; and brain-derived neurotrophic factor (BDNF) in learning and memory). (See Table IV.)

5) *Psychopharmacology* refers to the study, prevention, treatment of neurological and psychiatric or enhancement of psychological conditions through the use of drugs or pharmaceuticals (14, 20-22). There are a wide range of drugs; below are the conditions they are used most often for:

- *a.* Cognitive disorders where learning, memory and attention could be affected as seen in attention-deficit hyperactivity disorder (ADHD) and Alzheimer's (AD);
- *b. Personality* disorders which makes social coping rather difficult as in schizophrenia and anxiety;
- *c. Mood* disorders where there are fluctuations in the mental states of happiness or sadness of the individuals observed with depression and bipolar disorder.

#### Table III: Neurotechnologies – Brain-Machine Interfaces (BMI) and Prosthetics/Orthotics

- Cochlear implants, electronic devices that mimic the function of delicate cells of the inner ear, are approved for children under the age of 3 years. [LA Times, 08/03/09] <sup>i</sup>
- FDA approved DEKA's iBOT mobility system, whose self-balancing technology allows the user to go up and down staircases, navigate difficult terrain and "stand" at eye level with the ambulatory people around them. [USA Today, 08/14/03]<sup>ii</sup>
- The Boston Retinal Implant Project begins trials in 2010 for humans blinded by retinal degeneration. [MIT Technology Review, 07/25/08] <sup>iii</sup>
- Monkeys learned how to move a computer cursor with their thoughts using just one set of instructions [New York Times, 07/20/09], and a bionic arm to feed themselves [Nature, 05/28/08] <sup>iv</sup>
- Benefits of deep brain stimulation (DBS) were seen in Parkinson's patients over the age of 70 with only temporary sideeffects. [Science News, 01/31/09] v
- Transcranial magnetic stimulation (TMS) is used to treat depression. [US News and World Report, 07/15/09] vi
- Carbon-fibre prosthetic legs, called Cheetahs, allow a South African double-amputee to compete with able-bodied runners. [BBC Sports, 05/16/08] vii
- Functional electrical stimulation (FES) is shown to improve limb movements in patients with spinal-cord injury or stroke -induced paralysis and help them walk. [The Scientist, 01/01/09] viii
- BrainGate's Bionic chip implanted in the brain monitors its activity and allows a quadriplegic patient to convert her intentions into commands on a computer. [ABC 60 Minutes, 11/02/08] <sup>ix</sup>
- Ossur Bionics' Proprio Foot is the first intelligent foot module that thinks and responds to changing terrain such as stairs, slopes, flat or soft ground. <sup>x</sup>
- DEKA's Luke, the most advanced prosthetic arm, received funds from Department of Veterans Affairs and DARPA for a 3 year study among veterans. [Popular Science, 06/01/09] xi
- CyberDyne's Hybrid Assistive Limb (HAL) along with Raytheon's Sarcos and Lockheed Berkeley Bionics' Human Universal Load Carrier (HULC) exoskeleton suits can expand and improve physical capabilities, such as strength, speed and endurance, producing 'super-soldiers'. <sup>xii</sup>
- Institute for Human and Machine Cognition is building the undersea Performance Improving Self Contained Exoskeleton for Swimming (PISCES) system. [Wired, 09/17/08] xiii
- DynaVox Xpress is the world's most powerful handheld augmentative communication device, with internet and visual scanning capabilities, for patients who cannot use their voice due to autism, amyotrophic lateral sclerosis (ALS), Down's syndrome or stroke. [Scientific American, 08/10/09] xiv
- The OZ cockpit display provides superior human-centered situational awareness and flight performance information for manned and UAV pilots. [Avionics, 10/01/03] <sup>xv</sup>
- Sensory substitution technologies, such as tactile glove, sonar canes, vOICe Learning Edition and Brain Port tongue interfaces, are helping blind people to see. [The Globe and Mail, 03/21/09] xvi
- A Japanese rail firm has introduced an Omron Okao Vision facial recognition and scanning system to check that staff are smiling enough at all times. [BBC News, 07/11/09] xvii
- AspireReader, is a software reader that improves reading and learning outcomes by providing access to digital talking books, Internet pages, and words for individuals with sensory and cognitive disabilities. <sup>xviii</sup>
- According to Common Sense Media, parents are out of the loop when it comes to their children's time on social networking sites such as Facebook, LinkedIn, YouTube, MySpace and Twitter. [CNBC, 08/10/09] xix
- Second Life is the largest free online 3D virtual world, one of the many massively multiplayer online role-playing games (MMORPGs), imagined and acted on by digital personas or Avatars created by its Residents. <sup>xx</sup>
- The Special Interest Group on Graphics and Interactive Techniques (Siggraph) conference has a virtual reality exhibit that is giving visitors the extreme ranges of sight and hearing that many animals have. [BBC News, 08/07/09] <sup>xxi</sup>
- Mattel teamed up with Total Immersion to develop a new line of toy action figures, based on the upcoming action sci-fifilm Avatar, which would incorporate augmented reality technology. [Tech Show, 07/23/09] xxii
- The Infantry Immersion Trainer (IIT), the Asymmetric Warfare Virtual Training Technology (AW-VTT) and the Tactical Field Care Trainer (TC3) are some of the virtual reality training programs employed by the US military. [PBS FrontLine, 04/29/09] xxiii
- The DARPA's Augmented Cognition program and Office of Naval Research's Warfighter Performance Department have funded Design Interactive to develop innovative technologies to measure psychophysiological changes, such as EEG, pupil dilation, mouse pressure, body posture, heart rate, and galvanic skin response, in real time. [Wired, 03/21/07] <sup>xxiv</sup>
- The Simbionix Mentor simulator line offers clinicians the most realistic hands-on experience performing Minimally Invasive Surgery (MIS) and interventional procedures, at no patient risk. [BBC News, 05/23/09] <sup>xxv</sup>

#### Table IV: Neurotechnologies – Neuromics

- Scientists have discovered the first gene involved in regulating the optimal length of human sleep. [Science Daily, 08/14/09] <sup>i</sup>
- Intracellular location of the protein degradation machinery, or proteasomes, may help in memory formation and loss. [Science Daily, 04/25/08] <sup>ii</sup>
- RNA interference (RNAi) mediated gene silencing was carried out in non-human primates. [Nature, 05/04/06] <sup>iii</sup>
- A study used high-throughput sequencing to uncover active genes in a mammal's early brain development, including those that contribute to neurological disorders. [Science Daily, 07/27/09] <sup>iv</sup>
- A Nature study has produced the most compelling evidence to date that genetics play a key role in autism. [BBC News, 04/28/09] <sup>v</sup>
- A global analysis of brain proteins indicates protein expression changes occur early in life and precede onset of Huntington Disease. [Science Daily, 04/21/09] vi
- The first genetically altered monkey model that replicates some symptoms observed in patients with Huntington's disease was developed. [Science Daily, 05/19/08] vii
- Three rare deletions in the human genome appear to raise the risk of developing Schizophrenia considerably. [The New York Times, 07/31/08] viii
- Transplanted neural stem cells produce Brain-Derived Neurotrophic Factor (BDNF) and may rescue memory in advanced Alzheimer's disease. [Science Daily, 07/22/09] <sup>ix</sup>
- An earlier study linking depression to a specific Serotonin gene is now faulted. [The New York Times, 06/19/09] ×
- Mild oxidative stress, through hormesis, could prolong life. [Science Daily, 05/30/09] xi
- Estrogen can reduce stroke damage by inactivating a tumor-suppressing protein known to prevent many cancers. [Science Daily, 07/20/09] <sup>xii</sup>
- DOPAL, derived from Dopamine, is responsible for cell death causing Parkinson's disease. [Science Daily, 08/31/07] xiii
- Myelin genes appear to influence intelligence by determining the quality of the nerve axons which allow for fast signaling bursts in our brains. [Science Daily, 03/18/09] xiv
- The ability to measure glutamate levels in the brain over time provides an improved method for tracking Multiple Sclerosis and predicting its course. [Science Daily, 05/07/09] <sup>xv</sup>
- A region on chromosomes 1 could be responsible for modulating stress responses involved in complex behaviors like drug abuse. [Science Daily, 07/17/09] <sup>xvi</sup>
- The genes that play a role in adolescent insomnia are found to be the same as those involved in depression and anxiety. [Science Daily, 06/09/09] <sup>xvii</sup>
- A mouse model has been developed which exhibits seizures closely resembling those occurring with epilepsy in infants. [Science Daily, 06/07/09] xviii
- The 'jumping genes' that insert extra copies of themselves create diverse brain cells and can explain brain development, individuality and neurological disease. [Science Daily, 08/06/09] xix
- Melatonin, involved in circadian rhythms, can delay the first signs of aging in a small mammal. [Science Daily, 06/23/09] <sup>xx</sup>
- The American College for Medical Genetics has recommended testing for 29 disorders in new-born babies. [March of Dimes, Accessed on 10/09/09] <sup>xxi</sup>
- Ultrasound and amniocentesis are routinely used in pre-natal screening for Down syndrome and Spina bifida. [March of Dimes, Accessed on 10/09/09] xxii
- Pluripotent stem cells shown to generate new retinal cells necessary for vision. [Science Daily, 11/21/08]xxiii
- There is a heritable component of happiness which can be entirely explained by genetic architecture of personality. [Science Daily, 03/06/08] xxiv

It should however be noted that these conditions are not mutually exclusive in that more than one function can be affected in a given condition. There is often comorbidity of disorders in terms of their etiology and pathology. For example a patient suffering from post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) may exhibit anxiety and depression while having difficulties with attention or memory. This has implications both for diagnosis and treatments where normality of mental health becomes blurred. Besides ingestion, drugs can be delivered to the nervous system via injection, topical application and inhalation. Currently, efforts are underway to employ nanotechnology for targeting drugs to specific regions of the brain. In addition to pharmaceuticals drugs described above, other potential drugs include endogenous hormones like vasopressin and adrenaline that can have systemic effects through discrete pathways (21,22). Furthermore, nutritional stores and internet offer a variety of over-the-counter compounds - such as Gingko biloba, Aloe Vera, Ginseng, Carnitine, St.John's Wort, and Vitamins B, C and E - with purported medical benefits that may not have been scientifically studied or clinically validated. Lastly, people consume alcohol, coffee, chocolate and nicotine on a daily basis; and some indulge in illegal drugs like marijuana, ecstasy and heroin. While the chemicals in these drugs may provide acute benefits, long term use could lead to addiction and severe cognitive impairments.

#### Table V: Neurotechnologies- Psychopharmacology

- The FDA has approved a new drug called Saphris to treat schizophrenia and bipolar I disorder in adults. [WebMD, 08/14/09] <sup>i</sup>
- Taking antidepressants, such as Wellbutrin, Celexa, Lexapro, Prozac, Zoloft and Symbalta, can make young people more than twice as likely to feel suicidal. [Telegraph, 08/12/09] <sup>ii</sup>
- Rophynol, normally used for treating short-term insomnia, is also called "roofies" and abused as a date-rape drug. [BBC News, 02/04/99] <sup>iii</sup>
- Propranolol, before memory reactivation in humans, erased the behavioral expression of fear memory 24 hrs later and prevented the return of fear, with implications for PTSD. [Nature Neuroscience, 02/15/09] <sup>iv</sup>
- Modafinil (Provigil), prescribed for narcolepsy, and a dietary supplement Ephedrine are used by pilots to stay awake and alert for up to 30 hours. [Scientific American, 12/06] v
- Nanoparticles successfully delivered Dalargin, an analgesic, to the brain. [Journal of Pharmaceutical Sciences, 04/27/05] vi
- Hydralazine, an anti-hypertension drug, was coated to nanoparticles which prevented damage to brain and spinal cord cells. [Science Daily, 10/02/08] <sup>vii</sup>
- Combination therapy of Memantine and Donepezil is better in prolonging cognitive decline in Alzheimer's disease. [Science Daily, 07/23/08] viii
- Pain-killer opiods, such as Oxycontin, Vicodin and Percocet, are being increasingly abused leading to major addiction.[DHHS-SAMHSA, 07/08] <sup>ix</sup>
- Adderall and Ritalin, legal stimulants prescribed for ADHD, are increasingly used by students seeking a competitive edge by reducing fatigue while increasing reading comprehension, interest, cognition, and memory. [Nature, 04/09/08] <sup>x</sup>
- Use of antidepressants use among U.S. residents almost doubled between 1996 and 2005, along with a concurrent rise in the use of other psychotropic medications. [US News & World Report, 08/03/09] <sup>xi</sup>
- Ecstasy (MDMA), known as the 'love drug', may help PTSD patients deal with their memories more effectively by encouraging a feeling of safety. [Science Daily, 03/10/09] <sup>xii</sup>
- A multipurpose nanotechnology tool for medical imaging and therapy is now available. [Science Daily, 08/06/09] <sup>xiii</sup>
- Scientists developed nasal spray containing Interleukin-6 to improve memory. [Science Daily, 10/02/09] xiv
- Intranasal delivery of Oxytocin increased positive communication between couples. [Science Daily, 10/09/09] <sup>xv</sup>

Targeted drug delivery is expected to improve considerably due to the advent of nano-particles. The available scientific research and clinical findings, the de-stigmatization of psychiatric conditions and their commercialization, the ease of access to psychiatric care, the relatively cheaper costs and the human urge to improve or enhance through psychopharmacology therefore presents us with the most pressing concerns such as safety, specificity, access, addiction, commercialization and regulation. (See Table V.)

Enhancement through drugs and related issues have been reviewed in detail elsewhere (27-34).

# Discussion

Utilizing the scanning method, this paper has presented and categorized neurotechnologies into five categories- 1) Monitoring and Imaging; 2) Modeling and Reverse Engineering; 3) Brain-Machine Interfaces (BMI) and Prosthetics/Orthotics; 4) Neuromics; and 5) Psychopharmacology. We included representative examples of studies and products within each of these groupings along with a preview of future developments. In doing so, we hope to provide insights into the direction and pace of evolution of the field of neurotechnologies for futurists, scientists, engineers, clinicians, ethicists and policy-makers.

We emphasize that the categories described only serve to delineate the different strands, but in no way are implied to be mutually exclusive. On the contrary, they are necessarily related. Often, more than one technology can be employed towards a desired outcome. For example, there may come a time in the near future when a given condition, such as Alzheimer's disease, maybe predicted using fMRI and prevented or treated through gene silencing and nanodrugs.

Neurotechnologies, involve various degrees of invasiveness, and the ability to manipulate the nervous system (sometimes, irreversibly). While there are ethical issues, questions and problems that are common to the study and use of neurotechnology, in general, each technology raises somewhat different ethical questions with regard to perceived benefits, costs and harms. This in turn will determine its level of acceptance among the public. Some of the concerns are philosophical (e.g.- human identity); ethical (e.g.- autonomy and privacy); legal (e.g.- responsibility); scientific (e.g.- efficacy and safety research); economic (e.g.- commercialization); governmental (e.g.- regulation and weaponization); and socio-cultural (e.g.equity, stigma and discrimination).

Scanning was performed entirely online. Consequently, the results are limited to these developments that were available on the internet. Moreover, the data are drawn from the public domain and do not capture those studies and products protected by proprietary concerns of private sector, or classified status of military research. The search engines, keywords and online results were all in English. This excludes results published online or offline in languages other than English. A logical follow-up to this study would be to incorporate database and translation tools for mining offline and non-English data.

Neurotechnologies have and will alter human activity through products and tools that can restore, sustain, and/or enhance human function. The use- or perhaps mere presence- of such tools, models, norms, and practices could change business, culture, economics, health and public security. This implies 'creative alteration' of the very foundations of individual and social life, and obligates the responsible handling of any neurotechnology as each possess some capability to affect the human condition.

There are numerous drivers and barriers to the development and diffusion of emerging neurotechnologies. Costbenefit factors will largely affect the initiation, sustenance and availability of these technologies, and convergence appears to be evolving at an unprecedented pace. The rate and extent of development of such technologies will vary in different countries due to economics, public policy, and variations in need and capacity.

Therefore, it is obvious that legislation can enthuse or hinder technological initiatives. However, legistlative process is not uniform or universal. Traditional values, customs and religious views can often skew public (and governmental) opinion regarding research, development, and adoption of new technology.

Nations that are politically stable with sound economic policies would attract both domestic and international investors in neurotechnology. There is considerable concern that venture capical investment(s) in neurotechnology research and production in politically unstable governments could affect, if not determine, the focus, pace, and use of developments and products. This poses significant challenges in assigning intellectual property rights, setting standards and effectively regulating dual-use potential. Education and R&D infrastructure will play a key role for countries to remain competitive in convergent technologies. At the same time, privacy will become a cause for concern between individual freedom and national security.

These factors emphasize the importance of both 1) acknowledging and addressing ethical implications of convergent neurotechnologies, and 2) engaging ethical discourse toward anticipatory and necessary corrective action that direct sound use of these devices among various stakeholder groups (government, industry, academia, professional organizations, media and the general public). A growing body of literature is dedicated to this ethical discourse (35-43) and although beyond the scope of this overview, it is vital that such ethical considerations proceed in ways that are commensurate with the pace, breadth, and scope of technological progress (44)

# Conclusion(s)

The impact of neurotechnologies is increasingly evident in medicine, business, law, sports, arts and entertainment, and holds potential for both promise and peril. Any regard of such potential necessitates forecasting of the types and directions that current and proposed state-of-the-art neurotechnologies will assume.

Scanning is a first step of successful forecasting. The value of scanning is that it facilitates anticipation of future trends, and perhaps more importantly, enables planning and preparation. The accelerated pace of neurotechnological advancement and convergence warrants continuous monitoring and necessitates understanding of the impact that these developments- and their effects- might incur for individuals and societies, both in the short- and the long-term. These considerations are critical to inform and guide ethical aspects of public policy.

# Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank Dr. Dennis McBride at Potomac Institute of Policy Studies and Evan Faber at GWU for their expertise and advice for this study.

# Disclaimer

The opinions and claims in this article are those of the author(s) alone. Dr. Nukala completed this work while at the Center for International Science & Technology Poli-

cy, Elliott School of International Affairs, George Washington University, 1957 E St. NW, Suite 403, Washington, DC, 20052.

#### **Competing Interests**

*The author(s) declare that they have no competing interests.* 

### Notes

## Table I

- Desjardins S-J. Human mind: Sound and vision wired through same 'black box' [Internet]. 2009 Aug 12. Available from: http://www.physorg.com/ news169296854.html
- ii. Jacobs AJ. Do I love my wife? An investigative report. Esquire [Internet]. 2009 Aug 12. Available from: http://www.esquire.com/features/mri-of-love-0609
- iii. Ivanhoe Broadcast News. Brain scans of the future: Psychologists use fMRI to understand ties between memories and the imagination. Science Daily [Online video]. 2007 July 1 Available from http://www. sciencedaily.com/videos/2007/0710-brain\_scans\_of\_ the\_future.htm
- iv. Hopkin K. Does fMRI see the future? Scientific American [Internet podcast] 2009 Jan. Available from: http://www.scientificamerican.com/podcast/ episode.cfm?id=FE153964-AE8E-0363-1CD-B3FD0A7BB84BE
- v. Jagust W. Amyloid + Activation = Alzheimer's? Neuron. 2009; 63 (2).
- vi. No Lie MRI [Internet]. San Diego: No Lie MRI, Inc. Available from: http://noliemri.com/ and Cephos Corp. Tyngsboro, MA: Cephos Corp. [Internet]. Available from: http://www.cephoscorp.com/contactus/index.php and Narayan A. The fMRI brain scan: A better lie detector? Time [Internet]. 2009 July 20. Available from: http://www.time.com/time/health/ article/0,8599,1911546-1,00.html
- vii. Ivanhoe Broadcast News. Men are from mars: Neuroscientists find that men and women respond differently to stress. Science Daily [Online video]. 2008 Apr 1. Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com/videos/2008/0403-men\_are\_from\_mars.htm
- viii. Prichep LS. Quantitative EEG and electromagnetic brain imaging in aging and in the evolution of dementia. Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences. 1097: 156-167.

- ix. The Science Behind Brain SPECT Imaging and the Amen Clinics [Internet]. 2008 Oct 21. Available from: http://www.amenclinics.com/clinics/information/the-science-behind-brain-spect-imaging/
- Padoa-Schioppa C, Assad JA. The representation of economic value in the orbitofrontal cortex is invariant for changes of menu. Nature Neuroscience 2008; 11: 95-102
- xi. Sands Research [Internet]. El Paso, TX. Sands Resaerch. Available from: http://www.sandsresearch. com/ and Wright R. In definitive study - Sands Research challenges instant analysis of 2009 Super Bowl XLIII ads. Business Wire [Internet]. Available from: http://www.reuters.com/article/pressRelease/ idUS195626+24-Feb-2009+BW20090224
- xii. Meditation may increase gray matter. Science Daily [Internet]. University of California - Los Angeles 2009 May 13 Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2009/05/090512134655.htm
- xiii.Keim B. Religious experience linked to brain's social regions. Wired.com [Internet]. 2009 Oct 2. Available from: http://www.wired.com/ wiredscience/2009/10/god-brai/

### <u>Table II</u>

- NIH Blueprint for Neuroscience Research. [Internet]. Bethesda, MD: National Institutes of Health. Available from: http://www.neuroscienceblueprint. nih.gov/ and U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. NIH launches the Human Connectome Project to unravel the brain's connections. NIH News [Internet]. Bethesda, MD: National Institutes of Health; 2009 July 15. Available from: http://www. nih.gov/news/health/jul2009/ninds-15.htm
- ii. Allen Brain Atlas Resources [Internet]. Seattle (WA): Allen Institute for Brain Science. Available from: http://www.brain-map.org/ and Allen Institute for Brain Science [Internet]. Seattle (WA): Allen Institute for Brain Science. [updated 2009 Nov 24]. Available from: http://www.alleninstitute.org/content/about\_the\_institute.htm
- iii. Hanson Robotics [Internet]. http://hansonrobotics. wordpress.com/ and Tucker A. Robot babies. Smithsonian Magazine [Internet]. 2009 July. Available from: http://www.smithsonianmag.com/sciencenature/Birth-of-a-Robot.html
- iv. University of Reading. [Internet]. Neuromantic: A new freeware tool for neuronal reconstruction. 2008

March 31. Available from: http://www.reading.ac.uk/ neuromantic/

- v. The FACETS Project. [Internet]. Germany: Ruprecht-Karls-Universität Heidelberg. [updated 2010 19 Feb] Available from: http://facets.kip.uni-heidelberg. de/ and Graham-Rowe D. Building a brain on a silicon chip. MIT Technology Review [Internet]. 2009 March 25. Available from: http://www.technologyreview.com/computing/22339/
- vi. Palmer J. IBM plans 'brain-like' computers. BBC News [Internet] 2008 Nov 21. Available from: http:// news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/science/nature/7740484.stm
- vii. Numenta.com. [Internet]. Redwood City, CA: Numenta, Inc. Available from: http://www.numenta.com/ and Breuer H. Eyeing robots whose brains would work just like ours. The Guardian [Internet]. 2008 Apr 10. Available from: http://www.guardian.co.uk/technology/2008/apr/10/robot.brain
- viii. Cybernetic Intelligence Research Group. [Internet] READING, Berkshire, UK: University of Reading. http://www.reading.ac.uk/cirg/cirg-main.aspx and Piquepaille R. Exclusive: A robot with a biological brain. ZD Net [Internet] 2008 Aug 13. Available from: http://blogs.zdnet.com/emergingtech/?p=1009
- ix. Brains in Silicon. [Internet]. Stanford, CA: Stanford University. Available from: http://www.stanford.edu/ group/brainsinsilicon/challenge.html and Graham-Rowe D. Building a brain on a silicon chip. MIT Technology Review [Internet]. 2009 March 25. Available from: http://www.technologyreview.com/ computing/22339/
- x. Shachtman N. DARPA 2009: Brains-on-a-chip, transparent displays. Wired.com [Internet]. 2008
   Feb Available from: http://www.wired.com/ dangerroom/2008/02/darpa-2009-brai/#previouspost
- xi. SENSOPAC [Internet]. Available from: http://www. sensopac.org/ and Naik G. In search for intelligence, a silicon brain twitches. Wall Street Journal 2009 14 July; A14. Available from: http://online.wsj.com/article/SB124751881557234725.html
- xii. Complex Biosystems Modeling Laboratory. [Internet]. [updated 2010 Jan 4]. Available from: http:// biosystems.mit.edu/index.php and Zhang L, Strouthos CG, Wang Z. Simulating brainnext term tumor previous termheterogeneitynext term with a multiscale agent-based model: Linking molecular signatures, phenotypes and expansion rate. Mathematical and Computer Modelling 2009; 48(1-2): 307-319

- xiii. The Blue Brain Project. [Internet]. Laussane. Available from: http://bluebrain.epfl.ch/ and Fildes J. Artificial brain '10 years away'. BBC News [Internet]. 2009 July 22. Available from: http://news.bbc. co.uk/2/hi/technology/8164060.stm
- xiv. Cognition for Technical Systems. [Internet].
  München, Germany: Technische Universität
  München. Available from: http://www.cotesys.de/
  about.html and Dickinson Lab. [Internet]. Pasadena:
  California Institute of Technology. Available from:
  http://www.dickinson.caltech.edu/Research/Fly-OVision and Leggett H. Blowflies get virtal reality in flight simulator. Wired.com [Internet]. 2009
  July 31. Available from: http://www.wired.com/
  wiredscience/2009/07/flysim/
- xv. Project One. [Internet]. San Diego: UC San Diego. Available from: http://projectone.ucsd.edu/ and Japan child robot mimicks infant learning. Google News [Internet]. Available from: http://www.google. com/hostednews/afp/article/ALeqM5j1F1VEHkt-MpXSaXrLUgr4coIDfPg
- xvi. Decisions in Motion. [Internet]. Germany: University Regensburg. Available from: http://www.decisionsinmotion.org/index.html and Corley A-M. A robot that navigates like a person. MIT Technology Review [Internet]. 2009 June 30. Available from: http:// www.technologyreview.com/computing/22946/

# <u>Table III</u>

- United States Food and Drug Administration. [Internet]. Cochlear Implants. [updated 2009 Apr 16]. Available from: http://www.fda.gov/MedicalDevices/ProductsandMedicalProcedures/ImplantsandProsthetics/CochlearImplants/default.htm and Roan S. Cochlear implants open deaf kids' ears to the world. Los Angeles Times [Internet]. 2009 Aug 3. Available from: http://www.latimes.com/features/health/la-hedeaf-children3-2009aug03,0,6159335.story?page=1
- DEKA. [Internet]. Manchester, NH: DEKA R&D Corp. Available from: http://www.dekaresearch.com/ ibot.shtml and FDA approves souped-up wheelchair that climbs stairs. USA Today [Internet]. 2003 Aug 13. Available from: http://www.usatoday.com/news/ health/2003-08-13-wheelchair\_x.htm
- iii. Boston Retinal Implant Project [Internet]. Boston: Massachusetts Eye and Ear Infirmary. Available from: http://www.bostonretinalimplant.org/ and Bourzac K. Longer-lasting artificial eyes. MIT Technology Review [Internet] 2008 Sept 25. Available from: http://www.technologyreview.com/

## biomedicine/21420/

- iv. Blankslee S. Researchers train minds to move matter. New York Times. 2009 July 20;D:6. Available from: http://www.nytimes.com/2009/07/21/ health/21brai.html and Hopkin M. Monkeys move robotic arm using brain power. Nature News [Internet]. 2008 May 28. Available from: http://www. nature.com/news/2008/080528/full/news.2008.861. html
- v. Parkinson's brain surgery works in older patients, too. Science News 2009 Jan 31 (175) 3. Available from: http://www.sciencenews.org/view/generic/ id/39729/title/Parkinson%E2%80%99s\_brain\_surgery\_works\_in\_older\_patients,\_too
- vi. Baldauf S. Brain stimulation: Transcranial magnetic stimulation. U.S.News & World Report [Internet].
   2009 July 15. Available from: http://health.usnews. com/articles/health/brain-and-behavior/2009/07/15/ brain-stimulation-transcranial-magnetic-stimulation. html
- vii. Flex-Foot Cheetah. [Internet] Ossur. Foothill Ranch, CA: Ossur Americas. Available from: http://www. ossur.com/?PageID=13462#flex-sprint and Pistorius eligible for Olympics. BBC Sport 2008 May 16. Available from: http://news.bbc.co.uk/sport2/hi/ olympics/athletics/7243481.stm
- viii. Cleveland FES Center [Internet] Cleveland: Cleveland FES Center. Availble from: http://fescenter. org/index.php and Zielinska E. The first step to computer augmentation and neuroprosthetics lies in the connectino between nerve cell and metal. How are scientists bridging the gap? TheScientist 23(1) 32. Available from: http://www.the-scientist. com/2009/01/1/32/1/
- ix. BrainGate. [Internet]. Available from: http://www. braingate.com/index.html and 60 Minutes: Brain Gate. CNET TV [Internet]. 2008 Nov. 2 Available from: http://cnettv.cnet.com/60-minutes-braingatemovement-controlled-mind/9742-1\_53-50004319. html
- Proprio Foot. Ossur Bionics. [Internet]. Ossur. Foothill Ranch, CA: Ossur Americas. Available from: http://bionics.ossur.com/pages/312
- xi. DEKA Luke. [Internet]. Manchester, NH: DEKA R&D Corp. Available from: http://www.dekaresearch.com/deka\_arm.shtml and Hsu J. "Luke" arm begins widespread testing among veterans. Popsci 2009 June 1. Available from: http://www.popsci. com/scitech/article/2009-06/luke-arm-begins-widespread-testing-among-veterans

- xii. Cyberdyne Robot Suit "HAL" [Internet]. Ibaraki, Japan. 2009. Available from: http://www.cyberdyne. jp/english/robotsuithal/index.html and Raytheon. [Internet]. Time Magazine names the XOS 2 Exoskeleton "Most Awesomest" Invention of 2010. Available from: http://www.raytheon.com/newsroom/technology/rtn08\_exoskeleton/ and Berkeley Bionics. [Internet]. 2009 Available from: http:// berkeleybionics.com/exoskeletons/
- xiii.ihmc.us. Florida Institute for Human & Machine Cognition [Internet]. Available from: http://www. ihmc.us/ and Hambling D. Attack of the superstrength cyborg penguins. Wired.com [Internet].
  2008 Sept 17. Available from: http://www.wired. com/dangerroom/2008/09/attack-of-the-u/
- xiv. DynaVox Xpress. [Internet]. Pitsburgh, PA: DynaVox Mayer-Johnson 2009. Available from:http:// www.dynavoxtech.com/products/xpress/ and Greenemeier L. Getting back the gift of gab: Next-gen handheld computers allow the mute to converse. Scientific American [Internet]. 2009 Aug 10. Available from: http://www.scientificamerican.com/article. cfm?id=assistive-communication
- xv. Welcome to OZ. [Internet]. 2009. Available from: http://coe.ihmc.us/groups/oz/ and Gerold A. Oz: A revolution in cockpit display. Avionics Magazine [Internet]. 2003 Oct 1 Available from: http://www. aviationtoday.com/av/categories/commercial/Oz-A-Revolution-in-Cockpit-Display\_1125.html
- xvi. Zelek J. Wearable Sensory Substitution Devices for Navigation. O'Reilly Where 2.0 [Internet]. 2009 May 5. Available from: http://where2conf.com/ where2009/public/schedule/detail/7266 and The vOICe Learning Edition [Internet]. 2009. Available from: http://www.seeingwithsound.com/winvoice. htm and BrainPort Vision. BrainPort Technologies. [Internet]. Available from: http://vision.wicab.com/ index.php and Strauss S. Perfecting the 'seeing-eye glove'. [Internet]. The Globe and Mail 2002 Sept 3. Available from: http://www.theglobeandmail.com/ life/perfecting-the-seeing-eye-glove/article482886/
- xvii. "OKAO Vision" Face Sensing Technology [Internet].Omron Global. Available from: http://www. omron.com/r\_d/coretech/vision/okao.html and Rail staff face 'smile police'. BBC News [Internet]. 2009 July 11. Available from: http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/ asia-pacific/8146078.stm
- xviii. Aspire Reader. Axistive. [Internet]. [updated 2010 Sept 13]. Available from: http://www.axistive. com/aspirereader-4-0.html

- xix. Commonsense media. [Internet]. 2010. Available from: http://www.commonsensemedia.org/ and Parents out of touch with social teens. Word of Mouth Marketing [Internet]. 2010. Available from: http://www.facebook.com/note.php?note\_ id=251782615505
- xx. Second Life. [Internet]. 2010. Available from: http:// secondlife.com/whatis/ and mmorpg.com [Internet].
   2010. Available from: http://www.mmorpg.com/ gamelist.cfm
- xxi. ACM SIGGRAPH [Internet]. Association for Computing Machinery's Special Interest Group on Computer Graphics and Interactive Techniques.
  2010. Available from: http://www.siggraph.org/ and Palmer J. Tech gives humans animal senses. BBC News. [Internet]. 2009; Aug 7. Available from: http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/technology/8188070.stm
- xxii. Total Immersion. [Internet]. Augmented Reality Solutions: Los Angeles. Available from: http:// www.t-immersion.com and Techshowwire. Comic Con 2009: Mattel Launches Industry's First Toy Line Featuring Augmented Reality Technology at Comic-Con 2009 with Action Figures for Twentieth Century Fox's "Avatar". Available from: http:// techshowwire.com/?p=7622
- xxiii. Full Immersion. Frontline. [Internet]. 2009 Apr 29. Available from: http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/ frontline/digitalnation/waging-war/immersion-training/full-immersion.html
- xxiv. Design Interactive. [Internet]. Cleveland, Ohio: Simbionix USA Corp. 2010. Available from: http:// www.designinteractive.net/nextgen.html and Shachtman N. Pentagon's PCs bend to your brain. 2007; Mar 11. Available from: http://www.wired.com/ dangerroom/2007/03/the\_us\_military/
- xxv. Simbionix. [Internet]. 2010. Available from: http://www.simbionix.com/Products.html and Elliott
  J. My virtual surgery helped medics. BBC News [Internet]. 2009 May 23. Available from: http://news. bbc.co.uk/2/hi/health/8060853.stm

# Table IV

- University of California San Francisco. First human gene implicated in regulating length of human sleep. ScienceDaily [Internet]. 2009 Aug 14. [cited 2010 Nov 22] Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2009/08/090813142459.htm
- ii. Wake Forest University Baptist Medical Center. New finding on how memory is formed and stored. ScienceDaily [Internet]. 2008 Apr 25.

Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2008/04/080423171537.htm

- iii. Zimmerman TS, Lee AC, Akinc A, et al. RNAi mediated gene silencing in non-human primates. Nature [Internet]. 2006 May 4; 441: 111-114. Available from: http://www.nature.com/nature/journal/v441/ n7089/abs/nature04688.html
- iv. Penn State. Active genes discovered in the developing mammal brain. ScienceDaily [Internet]. 2009 Jul 27. Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com/ releases/2009/07/090713201616.htm
- v. Genes 'have key role in autism'. BBC News [Internet]. 2009 Apr 28. Available from: http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/health/8020837.stm
- vi. American Society for Biochemistry and Molecular Biology. Huntington disease begins to take hold early on. ScienceDaily [Internet]. 2009 Apr 21. Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com/ releases/2009/04/090416161135.htm
- vii. NIH/National Center for Research Resources. First transgenic monkey model of Huntington's Disease developed. ScienceDaily [Internet]. 2008 May 19. Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com/ releases/2008/05/080518152643.htm
- viii. Wade N. Gene hunters find hope and hurdles in schizophrenia studies. The New York Times [Internet]. 2008 Jul 31. Available from: http://www. nytimes.com/2008/07/31/health/research/31gene. html?\_r=1&em&ex=1217649600&en=9a75a087e7c 91c53&ei=5087%0A
- ix. University of California Irvine. Neural stem cells may rescue memory in advanced alzheimer's, mouse study suggests. ScienceDaily [Internet]. 2009 Jul 22. Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com/ releases/2009/07/090720190726.htm
- x. Caspi A, Sugden K, Moffitt TE, Taylor A, et al. Influence of life stress on depression: Moderation by a polymorphism in the 5-HTT gene. Science 2003 (301)5631:386-389. Available from: http://www. sciencemag.org/content/301/5631/386 and Carey B. Report on gene for depression is now faulted. [Internet]. The New York Times. 2009 Jun 16. Available from: http://www.nytimes.com/2009/06/17/ science/17depress.html?scp=1&sq=depression,%20 genetics&st=cse
- xi. University of California San Diego. How oxidative stress may help prolong life. ScienceDaily [Internet].

2009 May 30. Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2009/05/090528203726.htm

- xii. Medical College of Georgia. Estrogen can reduce stroke damage by inactivating protein. ScienceDaily [Internet]. 2009 Jul 20. Available from: http://www. sciencedaily.com/releases/2009/07/090716113304. htm
- xiii.Saint Louis University. Chemical that triggers Parkinson's disease discovered. ScienceDaily [Internet]. 2007 Oct 31. Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2007/10/071030153020.htm
- xiv. University of California Los Angeles. More evidence that intelligence is largely inherited: Researchers find that genes determine brain's processing speed. ScienceDaily [Internet]. 2009 Mar 18. Available from http://www.sciencedaily.com/ releases/2009/03/090317142841.htm
- xv. University of California San Francisco. Glutamate identified as predictor of disease progression in multiple sclerosis. ScienceDaily [Internet]. 2009 May 7. Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com /releases/2009/04/090429205604.htm
- xvi. Baylor University. Set of genes contributes to stress; Possible drug-taking behavior discovered. ScienceDaily [Internet]. 2009 Jul 17. Available from: from http://www.sciencedaily.com / releases/2009/07/090713222216.htm
- xvii. American Academy of Sleep Medicine. Genetic link found between anxiety, depression and insomnia. ScienceDaily [Internet]. 2009 Jun 9. Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com / releases/2009/06/090608071804.htm
- xviii. Children's Hospital of Philadelphia. Findings in epilepsy gene in animals may guide treatment directions for infants. ScienceDaily. [Internet]. 2009 Jun 7. Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com / releases/2009/06/090601121712.htm
- xix. Salk Institute. 'Jumping Genes' create diversity in human brain cells, offering clues to evolutionary and neurological disease. ScienceDaily. [Internet]. 2009 Aug 6. Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com /releases/2009/08/090805133013.htm
- xx. CNRS (Délégation Paris Michel-Ange). Melatonin: the fountain of youth?. ScienceDaily. [Internet].
  2009 Jun 23. Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com /releases/2009/06/090622064807.htm
- xxi. March of Dimes. Education and development for health professionals. [Internet] Available from: http://www.marchofdimes.com/Professionals/education\_newbornscreening.html

- xxii. March of Dimes. Birth Defects: what they are and how they happen. [Internet] Available from: http://www.marchofdimes.com/Baby/birthdefects. html
- xxiii. SUNY Upstate. Pluripotent stem cellsshown to generate new retinal cells necessary for vision, study finds. ScienceDaily [Internet]. 2008 Nov 21. Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com / releases/2008/11/081120210853.htm
- xxiv. Association for Psychological Science. Genes hold the key to how happy we are, scientists say. ScienceDaily. [Internet]. 2008 Mar 6. Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com / releases/2008/03/080304103308.htm

#### Table V

- Hitti M. FDA OKs new schizophrenia, bipolar drug. WebMD Health News. [Internet]. Available from: http://www.webmd.com/bipolar-disorder/ news/20090814/fda-oks-new-schizophrenia-bipolardrug
- Devlin K. Antidepressants 'make young more than twice as likely to feel suicidal'. The Telegraph [Internet]. 2009 Aug 12. Available from: http://www. telegraph.co.uk/health/healthnews/6010139/Antidepressants-make-young-more-than-twice-as-likely-tofeel-suicidal.html
- iii. Rohypnol. BBC Health. [Website]. Available from: http://www.bbc.co.uk/health/physical\_health/conditions/rohypnol.shtml
- iv. Kindt M, Soeter M, Vervliet B. Beyond extinction: erasing human fear responses and preventing the return of fear. Nature Neuroscience 2009; 12:256-258. Available from: http://www.nature.com/neuro/ journal/v12/n3/abs/nn.2271.html
- Moreno J. Juicing the brain: Research to limit mental fatigue among soldiers may foster controversial ways to enhance any person's brain. Scientific American Mind. 2006; 17(6): 66-73. Available from: http://repository.upenn.edu/neuroethics\_pubs/33/
- vi. Das D, Lin S. Double-coated poly (butylcynanoacrylate) nanoparticulate delivery systems for brain targeting of dalargin via oral administration. Journal of Pharmaceutical Sciences 2005; 94: 1343–1353. Available from: http://www3. interscience.wiley.com/journal/110478191/ abstract?CRETRY=1&SRETRY=0

- vii. Purdue University. Nanoparticles used to deliver treatment for brain, spinal cord injuries. Science Daily. [Internet]. 2008 Oct 2. Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com/ releases/2008/10/081001145120.htm
- viii. Massachusetts General Hospital. Benefit of combination therapy for Alzheimer's disease confirmed. Science Daily. [Internet]. 2008 Sept 23. Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2008/09/080922122510.htm
- ix. Substance Abuse and Mental Health Services Administration, Office of Applied Studies (2008). Results from the 2007 National Survey on Drug Use and Health: National Findings (NSDUH Series H-34, DHHS Publication No. SMA 08-4343). Rockville, MD. Available from: http://www.oas.samhsa. gov/nsduh/2k7nsduh/2k7Results.cfm#TOC
- x. Maher B. Poll results: look who's doping. Nature 2008;452, 674-675. Available from: http://www.nature.com.proxygw.wrlc.org/news/2008/080409/full/452674a.html
- xi. Gardner A. Antidepressant use in U.S. has almost doubled. U.S.News & World Report. [Internet]. 2009; Aug 3. Available from: http://health.usnews.com/articles/health/healthday/2009/08/03/ antidepressant-use-in-us-has-almost-doubled. html?PageNr=1
- xii. SAGE Publications UK. Ecstasy could help patients with post-traumatic stress disorder, study suggests. ScienceDaily [Internet]. 2009 Mar 10. Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com/ releases/2009/03/090309092953.htm
- xiii. University of Washington. All-in-one nanoparticle: A 'swiss army knife' for nanomedicine. ScienceDaily [Internet]. 2009 Aug 6. Available from: http://www. sciencedaily.com/releases/2009/07/090727191923. htm
- xiv. Federation of American Societies for Experimental Biology. Scientists develop nasal spray that improves memory Science Daily. [Internet]. 2009 Oct 2. Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com/ releases/2009/10/091001091752.htm
- xv. Elsevier. Oxytocin: Love Potion #1? Human hormone increases positive communication between couples. Science Daily. [Internet]. 2009 May 3. Available from: http://www.sciencedaily.com/ releases/2009/04/090429091232.htm

#### References

- 1. Kurzweil R. The singularity is near: when humans transcend biology. New York: Viking; 2005.
- 2. Halal WE. Technology's promise: expert knowledge on the transformation of business and society. New York: Palgrave Macmillan; 2008.
- 3. Institute for Alternative Futures, The 2029 Project: Achieving an ethical future in biomedical R&D. Alexandria VA, 2005.
- Olsen, JKB, Selinger E, Riis S. New waves in philosophy of technology. New York: Palgrave Macmillan; 2009.
- 5. Bostrom N. A history of rranshumanist rhought. Journal of Evolution and Technology. 2005. 14(1): 1-25.
- 6. Bunch BH, Hellemansm A. The history of science and technology: a browser's guide to the great discoveries, inventions, and the people who made them, from the dawn of time to today. Boston: Houghton Mifflin; 2004.
- Halal WE. The life cycle of evolution: a macro-technological analysis of civilization's progress. J. Futures Studies, 2004. 9(1): 59-74.
- Silberglitt RS. The global technology revolution 2020, in-depth analyses: bio-nano-materials-information trends, drivers, barriers, and social implications. Santa Monica, CA: Rand; 2006.
- Bainbridge WS, Roco MC. National Science Foundation (U.S.), World Technology Evaluation Center. Managing nano-bio-info-cogno innovations: converging technologies in society. Dordrecht, the Netherlands: Springer; 2006.
- Gillis M. Harnessing new technologies for the 21st century. Proceedings of Federal Reserve Bank of Dallas, 2003. p. 63-75.
- Giordano J. Neuroethics: coming of age and facing the future. In: Giordano J, Gordijn B, editors. Scientific and philosophical perspectives in neuroethics. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press; 2010. p. xxv-xxix
- NeuroInsights. The Neurotechnology Industry 2009 Report: Drugs, Devices and Diagnostics for the Brain and Nervous System. [Accessed on 10/06/09]
- Eaton ML, Illes J. Commercializing cognitive neurotechnology--the ethical terrain. Nat Biotechnol. 2007. 25(4): 393-7.
- 14. National Research Council (U.S.). Committee on Military and Intelligence Methodology for Emergent Neurophysiological and Cognitive/Neural Science Research in the Next Two Decades. Emerging cogni-

tive neuroscience and related technologies. Washington, D.C.: National Academies Press; 2008.

- 15. Husing B, Jancke L, Tag B. Impact assessment of neuroimaging. VDF, Zurich; 2006. p. 1-368.
- 16. Friedman R. Reverse engineering the brain. Biomed. Comp. Review. 2009; 5(2): 10-17.
- Leuthardt EC, Schalk G, Roland J, Rouse A, Moran DW. Evolution of brain-computer interfaces: going beyond classic motor physiology. Neurosurg Focus. Jul 2009; 27(1):E4.p. 1-11.
- 18. Petrella JR, Mattay VS, Doraiswamy PM. Imaging genetics of brain longevity and mental wellness: the next frontier? Radiology. 2008; 246(1): 20-32.
- 19. Robert JS. Gene maps, brain scans, and psychiatric nosology. Camb Q Healthc Ethics. 2007; 16(2): 209-18.
- Rose N. Neurochemical selves. Society, 2003; (Nov/ Dec): 46-59.
- National Research Council (U.S.). Committee on Opportunities in Neuroscience for Future Army Applications. Opportunities in neuroscience for future army applications. Washington, DC: National Academies Press; 2009.
- 22. National Center for Complementary and Alternative Medicine – Herbs at a glance. [Accessed on 08/07/09]
- Halal WE. Planning for performance enhancement technologies: research method, trends and forecasts. Technology. 2008; 11(1): 27-35.
- 24. Cornish E. Futuring: the exploration of the future. Bethesda, MD: World Future Society; 2004.
- 25. Halal WE, Kull MD, Leffmann A. The GWU forecast of emerging technologies: a continuous assessment of the technology revolution. Technological Forecasting and Social Change. 1998; 59(1): 89-110.
- 26. Clynes ME, Kline NS. Cyborgs and space. Astronautics. Sept; 1960.
- 27. Glannon W. Psychopharmacological enhancement. Neuroethics. 2008; 1: 45-54.
- Rose SP. Smart Drugs: do they work? Are they ethical? Will they be legal? Nat Rev Neurosci 2002. 3(12): 975-9.
- 29. Kramer P. Listening to prozac: A psychiatrist explores antidepressant drugs and the remaking of the self. New York: Penguin; 1993.
- Chatterjee A. Cosmetic neurology and cosmetic surgery: parallels, predictions and challenges. Camb Q Healthc Ethics 2007; (16)2: 129-37.
- 31. President's Council on Bioethics (U.S.) and Kass L. Beyond therapy: biotechnology and the pursuit of

happiness. Washington, DC: President's Council on Bioethics; 2003.

- 32. Savulescu J, Bostrom N. Human enhancement. Oxford: Oxford University Press; 2009.
- Singh I, Kelleher KJ. Neuroenhancement in young people: proposal for research, policy, and clinical management. AJOB Neuroscience; 2010. 1(1): 3-16.
- Wolpe PR. Treatment, enhancement, and the ethics of neurotherapeutics. Brain and Cognition. 2002; 50(3): 387-395.
- 35. Greely H. Neuroethics and ELSI: similarities and differences. Minn. J. Law Sci. Tech. 2006; 7:2.
- 36. Marcus S, Neuroethics: Mapping the field. New York: Dana Press; 2002.
- Illes J, editor. Neuroethics: defining the issues in theory, practice, and policy. NY: Oxford University Press; 2005.
- Glannon W. Defining right and wrong in brain science: essential readings in neuroethics. Washington, DC: Dana Press; 2007.
- 39. Levy N. Neuroethics: challenges for the 21st century. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press; 2007.
- 40. Giordano J, Gordijn B, editors. Scientific and philosophical perspectives in neuroethics. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press; 2010.
- 41. Racine E. Pragmatic neuroethics: improving treatment and understanding of the mind-brain. Cambridge: MIT Press; 2010.
- 42. Klein E. To ELSI or not to ELSI neuroscience: lessons for neuroethics from the Human Genome Project. AJOB Neuroscience 2010; 1(4): 3-8.
- 43. Giordano J, Olds J. On the interfluence of neuroscience, neuroethics and legal and social issues: The need for (N)ELSI. AJOB-Neuroscience 2010; 1(4): 12-14.
- Benedikter R, Giordano J, Fitzgerald K. The future of the self-image of the human being in the age of transhumanism, neurotechnology and global transition. Futures. 2010; In press: Available online 14 August 2010.